



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

A standard linear barcode. The text "BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY" is printed vertically along the left side of the barcode. The barcode itself consists of vertical black lines of varying widths on a white background. To the right of the barcode, the numbers "3 1761 061101283" are printed vertically.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 061101283

RESTITUTION

2009-2010

Professor Ernest J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

ROBERT LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP - 8 2009

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

RESTITUTION

2009-2010

Professor Ernest J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/restitution00wein_6

RESTITUTION

I. THE NATURE OF RESTITUTION

Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics, Book Five 1129a26 - 1132b20, (Ostwald trans.).....	1
Ernest J. Weinrib, Corrective Justice in a Nutshell, 52 U.T.L.J. 349 (2000)	6
<i>Edwards v. Lee's Administrator</i> , 96 S.W. (2d) 1028 (Ky. C.A., 1936)	13
<i>Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co.</i> (1910), 124 N.W. 222 (Minn. S.C.)	17
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937), § 122. Benefits Derived From the Exercise of Incomplete Privilege.....	20
Palmer, The Law of Restitution, Volume I, 139-140 (Boston and Toronto: Little, Brown, 1978)	22
<i>Foskett v. McKeown</i> [2003] 3 All ER 97 (HL)	23

II. THE DEVELOPMENT OF RESTITUTION

<i>Moses v. MacFerlan</i> (1760), 97 E.R. 676, 2 Burr. 1005 (K.B.)	35
Dobbs, Handbook on the Law of Remedies, (St. Paul: West, 1973) 229.....	37
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937)	51
Seavey and Scott, Restitution, (1938) 54 Law Quarterly Review 29, 29-32, 36-39	53
<i>Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. and Constantineau</i> , [1954] S.C.R. 725; [1954] 3 D.L.R. 785.....	57
<i>Pavey & Matthews Proprietary Ltd. v. Paul</i> (1986) 162 C.L.R. 221 (H.C. Australia).....	59
<i>Pettkus v. Becker</i> (1980), 117 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.)	64
<i>Hunter Engineering Co. v. Syncrude Canada Ltd.</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 426.....	72
<i>Peter v. Beblow</i> (1993), 101 D.L.R. (4th) 621 (S.C.C.)	80
<i>Dublin v. Building and Allied Trade Union</i> [1996] 2 ILRM 547 (S.C.)	93

III. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS

1. “One Cleans Another’s Shoes ...”

<i>Taylor v. Laird</i> (1856), 156 E.R. 1203	100
Restatement of Restitution - s. 2	101
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 101-103.....	102
<i>Greenwood v. Bennett</i> , [1973] 1 Q.B. 195 (C.A.).....	104
<i>Nicholson v. St. Denis</i> (1975), 8 O.R. (2d) 315 (C.A.)	107
<i>Gidney v. Shank</i> [1995] 5 W.W.R. 385 (Man Q.B.)	111

<i>Gidney v. Shank</i> reversed [1996] 2 W.W.R. 383 (Man C.A.).....	116
<i>LAC Minerals Ltd. v. International Corona Resources Ltd.</i> (1987), 44 D.L.R. (4th) 592 (Ont. C.A.); (1989) 61 D.L.R. (4th) 14 (S.C.C.).....	118
The Electrical Appliances Case BUNDESGERICHTSHOF (SEVENTH CIVIL SENATE) 31 OCTOBER 1963*	123
2. Incidental Benefits	
<i>Ruabon Steamship Co. v. London Assurance</i> , [1900] A.C. 6 (H.L.)	127
<i>Edinburgh and District Tramways v. Courtenay</i> [1909] S.C. 99	131
<i>United States v. Pacific Railroad</i> 7 S. Ct. 490 (1887)	133
3. Preserving Another's Property	
<i>Binstead v. Buck</i> (1777), 2 Wm. Black. 1117 (C.P.).....	135
<i>Nicholson v. Chapman</i> (1793) 126 E.R. 536 (C.P.).....	136
<i>Falcke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Company</i> (1886), 34 Ch. D. 234	138
<i>Great Northern Railway v. Swaffield</i> (1874) L.R. 9 Ex. 132 (Exch.).....	143
<i>Prager v. Blatspiel, Stamp and Heacock</i> , [1924] 1 KB 566 (KBD).....	145
<i>Jebara v. Ottoman Bank</i> , [1927] 2 KB 254 (C.A.)	147
<i>China Pacific S.A. v. Food Corporation of India (The Winston)</i> , [1982] A.C. 939 (H.L.)	148
Restatement of Restitution - s. 117.....	151
4. Preserving Another's Health	
<i>Jenkins v. Tucker</i> (1788) 126 ER 555 (C.P.).....	153
<i>Shallcross v. Wright</i> (1850) 50 E.R. 1174	154
<i>Matheson v. Smiley</i> , [1932] 2 D.L.R. 787 (Man. C.A.)	156
Restatement of Restitution - s. 116.....	158
5. Discharging Another's Liability	
<i>Moule v. Garrett</i> (1872), L.R. 7 Ex. 101 (Ex. Chamber).....	160
<i>Brooks Wharf & Bull Wharf, Ltd. v. Goodman Bros.</i> , [1936] 3 All E.R. 696 (C.A.)	162
<i>Owen v. Tate</i> , [1975] 2 All E.R. 129 (C.A.).....	165
<i>Norton v. Haggett</i> (1952), 85 A. 2d 571 (Vt. S.C.).....	171
<i>Regional Municipality of Peel v. Her Majesty the Queen in right of Canada</i> (1992), 98 D.L.R. (4th) 140 (S.C.C.)	173

* English version by Gerhard Dannemann, in Markesinis, Lorenz, Dannemann, *The German Law of Obligations* v. 1 (The Law of Contracts and Restitution: A Comparative Introduction 789 (1997).

IV. MISTAKEN PAYMENTS

1. The Irrelevance of Fault

<i>Kelly v. Solari</i> (1841), 9 M & W 54, 152 E.R. 24.....	185
<i>Clark v. Eckroyd</i> (1885), 12 O.A.R. 425	187
<i>R.E. Jones v. Waring and Gillow</i> , [1926] A.C. 670 (H.L.)	190

2. Change of Position

<i>Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v. Mobil Oil Canada Ltd.</i> (1975), 55 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.)	194
<i>Lipkin Gorman v. Karpnale</i> , [1992] 4 All E.R. 512 (H.L.)	196
<i>Dextra Bank & Trust Co Ltd v Bank of Jamaica</i> , [2002] 1 All ER (Comm) 193 (PC) 1 All ER (Comm) 193 (PC).....	208
<i>RBC Dominion Securities Inc. v. Dawson</i> (1994), 111 D.L.R. (4th) 230 (Nfld. C.A.).....	210
<i>Cheese v. Thomas</i> [1994] 1 All E.R. 35 (C.A., Civ. Div.).....	218

3. Mistake of Law and Invalid Exactions

<i>Garland v. Consumers' Gas Co.</i> , [2004] 1 S.C.R. 629.....	224
<i>Kingstreet Investments Ltd. v. New Brunswick (Department of Finance)</i> [2007] 1 SCR 3.....	235

V. RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS

1. Tortious Wrongs

<i>Lamine v. Dorrell</i> (1701), Ld. Ray. 1216	244
<i>United Australia v. Barclays Bank</i> , [1941] A.C. 1 (H.L.).....	245
<i>Phillips v. Homfray</i> (1883), 24 Ch. D. 439.....	250
<i>Strand Electric and Engineering v. Brisford Entertainments</i> , [1952] 2 Q.B. 246 (C.A.).....	254
<i>Olwell v. Nye and Nissen</i> , 173 P. 2d 652 (Wash. S.C., 1946)	259

2. Breaches of Fiduciary Obligation

<i>Reading v. Attorney General</i> , [1951] A.C. 507 (H.L.).....	262
<i>Attorney-General for Hong Kong v. Reid</i> , [1994] 1 A.C. 324 (P.C.)	267

3. Breaches of Contract

<i>British Motor Trade Association v. Gilbert</i> , [1951] 2 All E.R. (641) Ch.D.)	276
<i>New Orleans v. Firemen's Charitable Association</i> , 9 SO. 486 (La S.C., 1891).....	278
<i>Adras Building Materials v. Harlow & Jones</i> , February 11, 1988 (Supreme Court of Israel); [1995] Restitution Law Review 235	279
<i>Attorney General v. Blake</i> [2000] 4 All E.R. 385 (H.L.)	287

